Public Participation in Landscape Character Assessment!

Theory, Practice and A Toolkit

26th November 2015

Alison Harvey AILI MIPI
Introduction – 5 Parts

1. **The Theory** - What is meant by Collaborative and Participative planning - ‘Models’?

2. **Barriers to Participation** – Cultural and Social

3. **Social Structures** - Existing and New

4. **Case Study: Community-led Village Design Statements Toolkit** – Participative approach to management

5. **Incentives for Participation**
But first – an Overview!

GLOBAL ECONOMIC SPACE

‘THE GLOBAL VILLAGE’

PLUS UNECE Aarhus Convention
1. What is Participation?

- The corporate economy must be reined in – leading towards an ‘Active Society’ (Etzioni, 1968)
- Social Learning = Social Empowerment (Friedman, 1992)
- **Community Spirit** – need to strengthen the community as a moral infrastructure (Etzioni 1993) – **Moral Compass**?
- Empowerment *is* Participation (Wilcox, 1994).
Why Participation?

• Working together allows everyone to achieve more that they could do on their own – ‘Synergy’ and ‘Power To’ rather than ‘Power Over’

• Enhances democracy – participative democracy v representative democracy

• Concept of Social Capital and Capacity Building

• Striving for a fair, open & collaborative planning system
10 Key Ideas

1. Level of Participation
2. Initiation and Process – participation does not just happen!
3. Control - who is the Initiator?
4. Power and Purpose – information and money
5. Role of Practitioner?
6. Stakeholders and Community
7. Partnership – Trust/Commitment
8. Commitment v Apathy
9. Ownership of Ideas – “We thought of that!!”
10. Confidence and Capacity

(Wilcox, 1994)
Ladder of Participation

1. Manipulation
2. Therapy
3. Informing
4. Consultation
5. Placation
6. Partnership
7. Delegated Power
8. Citizen Control

Degree of Citizen Power
Degree of Tokenism

Non Participation

Participation – Skills Required from Communities?

- Leadership
- Mediation
- Teamwork
- Understanding – technical?
- ‘Shared’ Vision: 5-10 yrs (or longer) (Author’s emphasis)

Participation - Core Elements

- **Trust** and Understanding
- Access and Information
- Voices and Values
- Negotiation and Mediation
- Resources – time and technical

The ‘3 Cs’

Collaboration

Co-operation & Co-ordination
## 2. Barriers to Participation

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Cultural:</th>
<th>Social:</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>- Lack of education</td>
<td>- Social segregation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Lack of appropriate skills</td>
<td>- Alienation from government</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Lack of confidence</td>
<td>- <em>low social capital</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Lack of structural ties with existing organisations</td>
<td>- marginalisation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Lack of interest</td>
<td>- Lack of time and money</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>- Lack of Trust</strong></td>
<td>- Lack of access to the Web</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Lack of experience in negotiating</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Census 2006
N.B. no question on volunteerism levels in 2011 Census!
3. Social Structures –
Existing and New?

Existing:
• Local Authority – Planning, Heritage, Arts, Engineering, etc.
• Tidy Towns/EAOs, Irish Rural Link, Church Groups, GAA and LEADER Groups – **Youth Programme for TT?**
• Individual Civic Trusts – e.g. Dublin and Limerick Civic Trusts
• Heritage in Schools (HIS) Programme – **investment?**
• Irish Planning Institute (IPI) & other Professional Institutes

New Structures?:
• Public Participation Networks (PPNs) – **Monitoring?**
• **Irish Civic Trust?**
• Planning & Design Courses in Schools?
• Planning & Design Aid + ‘Community-led Toolkits’
4. Community-led Toolkit (i)

- 100 page Community-led Toolkit focuses on PLACE-MAKING, ‘CHARACTER’ AND COMMUNITIES
- Overall Project Management structures: huge collaboration involved in ‘PM Teams’ - 50+ people – Community Leaders, Heritage Council, Local Authorities, Third Level Institutes and DoECLG: HC as Lead Partner + Community
- ‘Participation’ not Consultation: UNECE Aarhus Convention
- Two CLVDS ‘Pilots’ 2009-2011 - Rural: Julianstown (Co. Meath) and Urban: Sandymount (Dublin City) – IPI Awards
- 100 people completed the multi-disciplinary CL Toolkit training course in 2012 (course was over-subscribed)
- International Liveable Communities Awards, Xiamen, China, December 2013- Nominated by Nat. Pride of Place
- IPI National Planning Award 2014 for Planning Innovation
- Toolkit Users? - DoECLG, Reg. Assemblies, Local Authorities (e.g. SDCC, Meath, DLRCC, Mayo), EirGrid, Tidy Towns, SEAI
- DoECLG has been a huge support since the start - EU URBACT III Programme - resources?
# VDS Toolkit – Structure (ii)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Foreword</td>
<td>From HC Chairman and CEO</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Part 1</td>
<td>Background and Introduction to the Community-led VDS Toolkit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Part 2</td>
<td>Community-led Village Design Statements – 8 Distinct and critical Steps</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Part 3</td>
<td>Further Information and Contact Details for Toolkit Author - Alison Harvey</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appendices:</td>
<td>Appendix 1: People involved...</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Appendix 2: Bibliography and further reading</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8 Fact Sheets</td>
<td>No. 1 - LA Heritage Officers (28 no.) contact details</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>No. 2 - Glossary of Terms</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>No. 3 - Overview of collaborative and participative process</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>No. 4 - Useful Websites</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>No. 5 - <em>Project Charter</em> Template</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>No. 6 - Template for CLVDS brief - Julianstown Brief, June 2009</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>No. 7 - Julianstown CLVDS scoring matrix</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>No. 8 - Sources of potential funding - funding streams</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Key Outcomes:

• Builds on existing community knowledge base – unique landscape, environment and heritage features within the historic core and surrounding area of their ‘village’

• Provides a community with a valuable planning and management ‘tool’ to ensure that changes are sustainable

• Creates a *Shared Vision, Agreed Design Principles* and *Agreed VDS Action Plan* to enhance a village’s historic form and fabric, and sense of place

• Fosters community capacity building – promotes participative democracy

• Generates social capital and revitalises local networks and partnerships

• Enhances quality of life and sense of belonging for village communities – both rural and urban.
# Part 2 - Community-led Village Design Statements – 8 Distinct and critical steps (Page 10)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Step:</th>
<th>Indicative Budget(^a):</th>
<th>Objective:</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Step 1 – Getting started</td>
<td>€300-€500</td>
<td>Establish the rationale (need) for the community-led VDS Project – three key questions to answer in relation to policy fit; community skills, interests and talents; and heritage base in village.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Step 2 – Getting going</td>
<td>€300-€500</td>
<td>Set up effective VDS project management, and communication and publicity structures, undertake stakeholder mapping, and identify supporting technical resources.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Step 3 – Getting into your stride</td>
<td>€300-€500</td>
<td>Scope out the VDS project, VDS stakeholder workshop, draft and finalise stakeholder workshop feedback report, confirm management structure, sign VDS project charter.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Step 4 – Striding out</td>
<td>€300-€500</td>
<td>Draft and agree a collaborative VDS brief for consultants, advertise for consultants, evaluate tenders and appoint preferred consultant.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Step 5 – Getting over the jumps</td>
<td>€12,000-€13,000</td>
<td>Formulate the community-led Village Design Statement involving the whole village community (grafting, drafting and finalising the VDS)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Step 6 – A clear round</td>
<td>€1,000</td>
<td>Organise and deliver the Big Launch Night – a community celebrates its VDS (take a breather after)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Step 7 – Meanwhile back at the ranch</td>
<td>€50,000+</td>
<td>Implement community-led VDS – reality bites!</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Step 8 – The winners’ enclosure</td>
<td>€2,000</td>
<td>Undertake VDS monitoring and evaluation – ‘a continuous circle of learning’</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

\(^a\) Costs are approximate and may vary depending on the scale and complexity of the project.
What is CHARACTER of an area?

- Levels of ENCLOSURE
- Setting
- Architectural STYLEs Richness & Detail, Colour
- MATERIALS & TEXTURE of buildings & street surfaces
- Age range of buildings
- Landmarks architectural cultural
- Image of the area
- Residents, Workers, Councillors, rest of the village, visitors etc.
- The ROLE of the area Then & Now
- Range Mix & Scale of USES
- Patterns of OWNERSHIP
- Building condition Rundown? Well kept?
- Transparency & Active Frontages - What can be seen from streets?
- Sounds & Smells
- Levels of Activity busy? speedy? tranquil?
- Pattern of spaces
- Size & alignment of plots
- Topography, sitting, edges etc.
- Pattern of access foot &/or vehicle
- Hierarchy & sequence of spaces

Source: Richard Guise; 2005
5. Incentives for Participation?

• Establish All-island ‘Networks’ – “Ireland is a relationship-based society” (Source: OECD ‘06)
• Multi-sectoral Planning/Design Training – Practitioners – link to proposed Aarhus Bill
• Multi-annual Budget for implementation/delivery
• ‘Project Charters’ – ‘relationship-based society’ – National PM Support Office?
• Trained and experienced Facilitators/Mediators
• Establish National Planning and Design Aid
• Community-led Toolkit Training Programme for Civic Leaders – investment needed
Summary

• What is ‘Participation’ – Theory & Models
• Ladder of Participation – 8 rungs
• Core elements – Trust and Understanding, etc.
• Barriers to Participation - Cultural and Social
• Social Structures – Tidy Towns, Irish Rural Link, GAA, etc. New structures are needed
• Award-winning Community-led VDS Toolkit – collaborative and participative process
• Incentives – New Networks, Training, etc.
• INVESTMENT NEEDED X SOCIAL CAPITAL!!

aharvey@heritagecouncil.ie